

2nd Floor Conference Room
Hillsdale City Hall
97 N Broad Street
Hillsdale, MI 49242

Board of Review Minutes
City of Hillsdale
March Meeting – MCL 211.30

Tuesday, March 7, 2017
Monday, March 13, 2017
Tuesday, March 14, 2017
www.cityofhillsdale.org

ORGANIZATIONAL MEETING

Call to Order and Pledge of Allegiance

Assessor Thomas called the organizational meeting of the City of Hillsdale 2017 March Board of Review to order at 9:02 a.m. Tuesday, March 7, 2017. Assessor Thomas advised that she was not a voting member of the Board but that she would lead the meeting and keep minutes until such time as the Board appointed a Chair and Secretary as the prior Chair and Secretary were no longer serving. All three current members are serving their first term and attended training by the Hillsdale County Equalization Director using State Tax Commission (STC) materials. In addition, Board members were provided with STC Bulletins, FAQ's and Guidelines and given information on where to find information on the www.michigan.gov website as part of their welcome packet upon being appointed.

Roll Call

Members present:	Anthony Vear Richard Curtis Donna McKay
Members absent:	Ed Sumnar (alternate – presence not requested)
Also present:	Assessor, Kimberly Thomas

Election of chair & secretary

Motion by McKay, seconded by Curtis to nominate Vear as Chair. Motion carried unanimously.

Motion by McKay, seconded by Vear to nominate Curtis as Secretary. Motion carried unanimously.

Assessor Thomas abdicated leadership of the meeting and the minutes to Chair Vear and Secretary Curtis.

Approval of Agenda

Motion by Curtis, seconded by McKay to approve the agenda as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

Public Comments on Agenda Items

None

Old Business

1. MTT update – Assessor Thomas indicated that there was one Michigan Tax Tribunal (MTT) appeal pending at this time with a telephonic hearing scheduled for April.
2. Approval of Minutes of previous meeting (December 13, 2016) – Motion by McKay, seconded by Curtis to approve the minutes of the December 13, 2016 meeting as prepared by the prior secretary.

2nd Floor Conference Room
Hillsdale City Hall
97 N Broad Street
Hillsdale, MI 49242

Board of Review Minutes
City of Hillsdale
March Meeting – MCL 211.30

Tuesday, March 7, 2017
Monday, March 13, 2017
Tuesday, March 14, 2017
www.cityofhillsdale.org

New Business

1. 2017 appeal procedures
 - a. Board members received and reviewed STC Bulletin No. 15 of 2015 outlining 2017 Property Tax Appeal Procedures as determined by statute.
 - b. Board members received and reviewed Appeal Procedures currently followed for City of Hillsdale March Board of Review appeals. Some discussion followed regarding the handling of walk-in petitioners. Discussion and handout of poverty exemption (MCL 211.7u) standards and Federal income guidelines. In the case of an exemption under MCL 211.7u, the exemption must be approved by both a majority of the Board and the assessor. All other decisions are strictly the responsibility of the Board. Consensus was reached to maintain appeal procedures as previously adopted.
2. 2017 assessment roll, land value and Economic Condition Factor (ECF) maps & equalization studies were presented to the Board by the Assessor and discussed. The Board was also provided with a binder containing state reference guides on various assessment related topics.
3. Correspondence (not petitions) – None.

General Public Comments – None

Recess – 9:33 a.m.

TAXPAYER APPEAL MEETINGS

Call to Order - 8:55 a.m. Monday, March 13, 2017

Roll Call

Members present:	Anthony Vear Richard Curtis Donna McKay
Also present:	Assessor, Kimberly Thomas Gene Ellison, petitioner, M17-008

Petitions

In Person petitioners appeared by appointment as follows:

- M17-008 - 9:00 a.m. Gene Ellison – assessed value, exemption under MCL 211.7u - application, proof of income, and wife's death certificate attached. Assessor Thomas completed the exemption worksheet and determined that petitioner passed both the income and asset tests under City policy and guidelines. Motion by McKay, seconded by Vear to grant partial exemption. Taxable Value reduced for 2017 only to 11,386, resulting in estimated property taxes equal to 3.5% of income per City policy. Motion carried unanimously. Assessor concurred. Partial exemption granted. No change to AV.
- M17-009 - 9:15 a.m. Chris Parks - assessed and taxable values – purchased for \$195,000 in 2016, submitted copy of appraisal for Wells Fargo/VA financing dated 7/15/2016.

2nd Floor Conference Room
Hillsdale City Hall
97 N Broad Street
Hillsdale, MI 49242

Board of Review Minutes
City of Hillsdale
March Meeting – MCL 211.30

Tuesday, March 7, 2017
Monday, March 13, 2017
Tuesday, March 14, 2017
www.cityofhillsdale.org

Motion by Vear, seconded by Curtis to approve revised AV & TV at 102,500 based on appraisal submitted. Motion carried unanimously.

Written petitions were pre-numbered and presented by Assessor Thomas as follows:

- M17-001 Taylor – Disabled Veterans Exemption - Affidavit and VA letter showing payment at 100% level due to unemployable status attached. Motion by McKay, seconded by Vear to grant exemption under MCL 211.7b for 2017 only. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-002 Ridenour – MCL 211.7u exemption (Application and proof of income, household expenses, and assets attached). Assessor Thomas provided an analysis worksheet to determine petitioner's qualification under City asset test and Federal Poverty Income Level guidelines. Petitioner's income level was slightly above the federal poverty level guidelines for a 3 member household, but provided proof of "substantial and compelling reasons why there should be a deviation from the policy and guidelines" adopted by the City. Motion by Vear, seconded by McKay to grant a partial poverty exemption. Taxable value reduced for 2017 only to 23,392, resulting in estimated taxes equal to 3.5% of income per City policy. Motion carried unanimously. Assessor concurred. Partial exemption granted. No change to AV.
- M17-004 GE HFS – Personal Property amended statement (software, warranty and training expenses included in costs originally reported in error). Motion by McKay, seconded by Vear to approve revised AV & TV of 552,300. Motion carried unanimously.

In Person petitioners appeared by appointment as follows:

- M17-010 – 10:00 a.m. Charles Sigler – assessed value – property does not meet minimum width requirements to be buildable under zoning. Motion by Vear, seconded by Curtis to change AV to \$1,900 with no effect to TV. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-011 – 10:15 a.m. Edward Trubey – assessed value – "Real Estate Evaluation" by Southern Michigan Bank & Trust Credit Analyst March 2016 with reconciliation of value based on three comparable sales (MLS reports attached). Assessor Thomas also provided a list and analysis of 20 comparable sales within the same ECF neighborhood printed out of the BS&A CAMA software utilized by the City for property tax assessment. Motion by Curtis, seconded by McKay to change AV to \$26,900 with no effect to TV. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-007 (petition number pre-assigned by Assessor in anticipation of presenting as written petition) – 10:30 a.m. Hugh Whitmore for the Margaret Whitmore Trust – assessed value – petitioner paid \$13,000 for property in January, contends the actual value is \$10,000. Petitioner indicated that his property was negatively impacted by foreclosed houses on both side of his property on Bacon Street and blighted properties to the south on Wolcott Street. Assessor Thomas indicated that if Mr. Whitmore had failed to appear, she had intended to petition for a revised estimate of true cash value of \$17,300 (reduced from \$34,200) due to location, lack of water and sewer hookups following demolition of the house, and the agricultural-type construction of the building (previously assessed as a residential garage). Board Chair Vear indicated that he would like to drive

2nd Floor Conference Room
Hillsdale City Hall
97 N Broad Street
Hillsdale, MI 49242

Board of Review Minutes
City of Hillsdale
March Meeting – MCL 211.30

Tuesday, March 7, 2017
Monday, March 13, 2017
Tuesday, March 14, 2017
www.cityofhillsdale.org

by the property on his way home Monday evening before they made a decision. Motion made on March 14, 2017 by Vear, seconded by McKay to change AV to 8,700 with no effect to TV. Motion carried unanimously.

Written petitions were pre-numbered and presented by Assessor Thomas as follows:

- M17-005 Grayhawk Leasing – Petitioner timely filed form 5076 claiming Small Business Tax Exemption for Personal Property within the City with a total value under \$80,000 – data entry error. Motion made by McKay, seconded by Vear to grant exemption for 2017 only under MCL 211.9o. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-006 US Bank National Association – correction of data entry error brought to the assessor’s attention by the taxpayer. Motion by McKay, seconded by Curtis to change AV & TV to 23,200. Motion carried unanimously.

Recess - 11:55 a.m.

Call To Order - 12:53 p.m.

Roll Call

Regular Members present: Anthony Vear
 Richard Curtis
 Donna McKay
Also present: Assessor, Kimberly Thomas

Petitions

In Person petitioners appeared by appointment as follows:

- M17-012 – 1:00 p.m. Karlye Horton, Attorney for John M Chase Jr Trust, owner of Walnut Arms Apartments – assessed value – submitted 2017 Personal Property statement. Assessor indicated that assessed value had been estimated due to the failure on the part of the owner to file a statement. Assessor advised that the most recent statement in the file for Walnut Arms was submitted in 1995, prior to purchase by Mr. Chase. Assessor also advised petitioner that property owner would likely qualify for the small taxpayers exemption based on the information submitted, but that the deadline to file the affidavit to claim the exemption was February 10 so they could not claim the exemption for 2017. Motion made by Vear, seconded by Curtis to change AV & TV to 3,500. Motion carried unanimously.

Written petitions were presented by Assessor Thomas as follows:

- M17-013 Perry – assessed value - Letter and sales comparables received by mail on March 13. Based on the letter and information provided, the Board members were of the opinion that petitioner did not understand Michigan property tax law and likely just needed an explanation. Member Curtis offered to call petitioner during the next recess to answer petitioner’s questions. March 14, 2017 – Curtis advised the rest of the Board that petitioner expressed that they would like to withdraw their request based on the

2nd Floor Conference Room
Hillsdale City Hall
97 N Broad Street
Hillsdale, MI 49242

Board of Review Minutes
City of Hillsdale
March Meeting – MCL 211.30

Tuesday, March 7, 2017
Monday, March 13, 2017
Tuesday, March 14, 2017
www.cityofhillsdale.org

information he provided. Motion by Curtis, seconded by Vear to deny petitioner's appeal based on the request to withdraw. Motion carried unanimously.

In Person petitioners appeared by appointment as follows:

- M17-014, M17-015, M17-016, M17-017 and M17-018 – 2:00 p.m. Debra Young for Alamo Division – assessed value – petitioner's request was for a reduction of overall tax burden due to loss of long-term tenant and decreased value of building from lack of maintenance and functional obsolescence. Assessor provided a list of industrial building sales between October 1, 2014 and December 31, 2016 for comparison.
 - M17-014 – motion by Vear, seconded by Curtis to change AV & TV to 168,000 due to functional obsolescence and structural repairs needed and supported by comparable sales. Motion passed unanimously.
 - M17-015 – motion by Vear, seconded by McKay to deny petitioner's request. Motion passed unanimously.
 - M17-016 – motion by McKay, seconded by Vear to deny petitioner's request. Motion passed unanimously.
 - M17-017 – motion by Curtis, seconded by McKay to deny petitioner's request. Motion passed unanimously.
 - M17-018 – motion by Vear, seconded by McKay to deny petitioner's request. Motion passed unanimously.
- M17-019 – 3:00 p.m. Vicky McNair – assessed value - Petition form was correct to reflect a reduction in the assessed value from \$63,300 to \$45,300 by the assessor due to a review in response to petitioner's request for an appointment to file an appeal. This change was made prior to the assessor printing the assessment roll on the First Monday in March for presentation to the Board, in compliance with Michigan's General Property Tax Act. Petitioner contented that the True Cash Value of the property is \$52,000 based on her purchase price in February of 2016 and presented a letter from realtor Christie Plemmons. Plemmons indicated a reasonable selling price of mid to upper \$60k's for petitioner's property in the current market based on "3 recently sold comparable properties. Attached to the letter were the MLS listings for five properties sold between May 12, 2015 and December 16, 2016 with a low sold price of \$41,500 and a high sold price of \$98,000. It was unclear which three sales Ms. Plemmons' opinion was based upon. Discussion followed regarding the effect of combining the house and adjacent vacant parcel on the 2017 assessment. Assessor Thomas indicated that the value was increased from 2016 to 2017 primarily because the house was assessed as having no heating and cooling and being only 75% functional in 2016 because it was uninhabitable, as testified to by petitioner at the 2016 Board of Review. As Ms. McNair is now occupying the residence there was an increase in the assessed value for installation of forced air heating & cooling, as well as a general increase in the residential market, not because of the parcel combination. There were no "additions" used in the taxable value calculation. However, because there was a transfer of ownership in 2016 the 2017 TV will be the same as the SEV. Record cards were provided for the separate (retired) parcels showing a total land value of \$65,658 if assessed separately based on the 2017 square footage rate typically used for residential parcels under 1 acre. This square

2nd Floor Conference Room
Hillsdale City Hall
97 N Broad Street
Hillsdale, MI 49242

Board of Review Minutes
City of Hillsdale
March Meeting – MCL 211.30

Tuesday, March 7, 2017
Monday, March 13, 2017
Tuesday, March 14, 2017
www.cityofhillsdale.org

footage rate was calculated from vacant lot sales in residential neighborhoods throughout the City. By comparison, the record card for the parcel under appeal showed a total land value of \$24,000 for 1.69 acres based on the per acre rate from larger land sales during the same time period. Petitioner also indicated that her property was negatively impacted by several blighted properties at the north end of her section of Wolcott Street. Assessor Thomas provided a list and analysis to the Board of 16 comparable sales within the same ECF neighborhood printed out of the BS&A CAMA software utilized by the City for property tax assessment. Board Chair Vear indicated that he would like to drive by this property on his way home Monday evening before they made a decision, as it was in the same stretch of Wolcott Street as Mr. Whitmore's property. March 14, 2017 – motion by McKay, seconded by Curtis to change the AV & TV to 43,000 based on a 5% negative adjustment to the building value for external obsolescence caused by nearby blighted properties. Motion carried unanimously.

- M17-020 – 3:30 p.m. David Roberts – assessed and taxable value and classification - petitioner indicated that he had purchased the property in question for \$43,000 in 2016. The only improvements to the property since his purchase have been a new roof and other normal repair and maintenance. When asked why the record card showed a sale price of \$52,000, Mr. Roberts indicated that there were seller concessions including payment of the buyer's closing costs by the seller in exchange for a promissory note from the buyer to the seller involved. It was also noted by the assessor that the sale was part of a bankruptcy proceeding. Assessor Thomas asked Mr. Roberts to clarify how many residential housing units were currently in the building and what condition they were in. Mr. Roberts indicated that there was a rented unit on the first floor but that the upstairs unit was still uninhabitable but he intended to renovate it for his own use. He indicated that there was also an uninhabitable efficiency unit at the rear of the downstairs in what was originally a porch. He wasn't sure yet what his plans were for that area. He also indicated that he had cleaned up the exterior property area around the garage but the garage itself still needed repair. Petitioner also questioned the change in classification from 402 to 401. Assessor Thomas explained that both were used for residential properties but the state recommended codes for improved vs vacant properties differed from what had historically been used at the county level so they were in the process of changing over the state recommended codes. Assessor Thomas provided a list and analysis to the Board of 20 comparable sales within the same ECF neighborhood printed out of the BS&A CAMA software utilized by the City for property tax assessment. Motion by Vear, seconded by McKay to change the AV and TV to \$26,000 based on the condition of the upstairs unit. No change to classification. Motion carried unanimously.

Recess - 4:35 p.m.

Call to Order – 1:53 p.m. Tuesday, March 14, 2017

Roll Call

Members present:

Anthony Vear
Richard Curtis
Donna McKay

2nd Floor Conference Room
Hillsdale City Hall
97 N Broad Street
Hillsdale, MI 49242

Board of Review Minutes
City of Hillsdale
March Meeting – MCL 211.30

Tuesday, March 7, 2017
Monday, March 13, 2017
Tuesday, March 14, 2017
www.cityofhillsdale.org

Also present: Assessor, Kimberly Thomas

Petitions

In Person petitioners appeared by appointment as follows:

- M17-021 – 2:00 p.m. Donald Hernandez – assessed value – petitioner had questions about why his assessment had decreased. Upon review of the record card and based on familiarity with the property by Board members and the assessor, it was determined that the class of construction used in the assessment was incorrect and should be revised to accurately calculate the current value of the property. Motion made by McKay, seconded by Vear to change the AV to 87,400 with no effect on TV based upon a correction of the residential building class to BC. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-022, M17-023 and M17-024 – 2:15 p.m. Brett Boyd for the Roger L Boyd Trust/Hillsdale Market House – assessed value – petitioner had questions about the specific taxes and assessment under the Commercial Rehabilitation Exemption (CRE) Certificate and presented documentation of his assessment and that of competing properties. Petitioner’s contention was that the rehabilitation project should not have resulted in a higher assessed value because, based on a comparison of their pre-renovation building assessment to similarly used properties, they were already being assessed as if the building had been adequately maintained and updated. He indicated that he felt should have done more research and appealed the assessment before applying for the abatement and starting the renovation project.
 - M17-022 Motion by Curtis, seconded by McKay to deny petitioner’s request based on the “frozen” value for this parcel under the CRE. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-023 Motion by Vear, seconded by Curtis to change the AV & TV to 0 in recognition that the rehabilitation did not add value over the value indicated by the frozen building assessment and in order to keep uniformity in assessments with similarly improved properties. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-024 Motion by McKay, seconded by Vear to deny petitioner’s request as petitioner indicated assessment was in line with his opinion of true cash value on the land. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-025 and M17-026 – 3:30 p.m. Mike Neely for Neely Properties, LLC – assessed value – Petitioner contended that the assessment should be more in line with his purchase price paid in 2016 due to the condition of the building and the length of time the property was on the market before he purchased it. The Board and Assessor discussed the appropriateness of applying an adjustment for functional obsolescence due to the change in use without any substantial redesign of the building.
 - M17-025 motion by Curtis, seconded by McKay to change AV & TV to \$22,500 based on a 20% reduction in land value for easement access only. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-016 motion by Vear, seconded by McKay to change AV & TV to \$84,500 based on a 10% reduction to the building value for functional obsolescence. Motion carried unanimously.

- M17-027, M17-028, M17-029, M17-030, M17-031, M17-032, M17-033 & M17-034 – 3:45 p.m. Grant Baker on behalf of himself and his co-owners – assessed value – Petitioner had questions about the sales used to determine values on his downtown properties. Assessor provided a copy of the 2017 commercial building ECF study for the TIFA Historic district. Petitioner also question why the assessments within the same district all changed by different percentages. He also questioned the value of his residential vacant parcel. In addition, he received a notice of assessment for a tiny parcel owned by Cold Spring Woods, Inc but did not complete a petition form for this parcel. The assessor indicated that this parcel was a gap between deeds from Cold Spring Woods, Inc discovered by a title agent while verifying title history on the parcel with which it was previously being assessed. The notice was being sent to all the adjacent property owners in the hopes that one of them had an unrecorded deed establishing ownership of the parcel. Assessor indicated to the board that she would do a more in-depth analysis of the % of change on the downtown parcels and send her findings to Mr. Baker.
 - M17-027 Motion by McKay, seconded by Vear to deny petitioner’s request. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-028 Motion by Curtis, seconded by McKay to deny petitioner’s request. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-029 Motion by McKay, seconded by Curtis to deny petitioner’s request. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-030 Motion by Vear, seconded by Curtis to deny petitioner’s request. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-031 Motion by McKay, seconded by Vear to deny petitioner’s request. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-032 Motion by Vear, seconded by McKay to deny petitioner’s request. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-033 Motion by Curtis, seconded by McKay to deny petitioner’s request. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-034 Motion by Vear, seconded by McKay to deny petitioner’s request. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-035 – 4:30 p.m. Steve Vear – assessed value – Chairman Anthony Vear recused himself from hearing this petition as the petitioner is his brother. Petitioner requested a reduction in assessed value based on a comparison of the per square foot rate used to determine his building value compared with the building to his south. Assessor Thomas indicated to the Board that the difference in square foot rate was attributable to the upstairs on Mr. Vear’s building being finished as a residential apartment and the upstairs of the adjacent building being office space. Motion by Curtis, seconded by McKay to deny petitioner’s request. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-036, M17-037 and M17-038 – 4:35 p.m. Steve Vear on behalf of Shirley Bratton – assessed & taxable value – Chairman Anthony Vear recused himself from hearing these petitions as the petitioner is his brother. Petitioner indicated that Ms. Bratton is a client of his accounting firm and is in failing health. He presented a hand-written comparison of the assessment on Ms. Bratton’s home with those of her neighbors for the years 2014-

2017. He did not indicate what he believed the value of her property was, only that the change in assessment was not consistent with her neighbors. Mr. Vear also requested a change in classification of the vacant lot with frontage on Broad Street (M-99) from commercial to residential so that it would qualify for the Principal Residence Exemption (PRE). He also requested a reduction in assessment on the vacant lot on Charles Street but did not provide an estimate of True Cash Value. Assessor Thomas confirmed to the Board that the vacant property on Broad Street is zoned B-3 General Business but that the properties on either side were improved with residential structures, currently used as residences and were classified as residential based on that use. Assessor Thomas provided a list and analysis to the Board of 12 comparable home sales within the same ECF neighborhood printed out of the BS&A CAMA software utilized by the City for property tax assessment.

- M17-036 Motion by McKay, seconded by Curtis to deny petitioner's request as he did not indicate his estimate of True Cash Value. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-037 Motion by McKay, seconded by Curtis to deny petitioner's request as the highest contributing use would be commercial based on zoning and location. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-038 Motion by McKay, seconded by Curtis to deny petitioner's request. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-039 – 4:45 p.m. Tim Frosch for 44 Blue & Gold, LLC – taxable value – Mr. Frosch indicated that the taxable value had increased more than the rate of inflation but that no improvements had been made on the property in 2016. Assessor Thomas indicated that the structure had been assessed as partially complete due to being partially gutted as of December 31, 2015. Mr. Frosch indicated that the structure was partially gutted and renovated in 2015 but that all work was completed prior to December 31 so the assessment should not have been reduced for partial construction. Assessor Thomas verified that the building permit was given final approval prior to December 31, 2015. She further found that the taxable value was not reduced for “losses” on the 2016 assessment, so felt that it was not appropriate to have made “additions” in calculating the 2017 taxable value. The 2016 capped value was below the 2016 SEV even with the adjustment for partial construction, so the adjustment had no effect on TV. Motion by Vear, seconded by McKay to change TV to \$23,429 based on the revised capped value after removal of additions. Motion carried unanimously.

Recess - 5:15 p.m.

Call to Order – 5:55 p.m.

Roll Call

Members present:

Anthony Vear
Richard Curtis
Donna McKay

Also present:

Assessor, Kimberly Thomas

Petitions

2nd Floor Conference Room
Hillsdale City Hall
97 N Broad Street
Hillsdale, MI 49242

Board of Review Minutes
City of Hillsdale
March Meeting – MCL 211.30

Tuesday, March 7, 2017
Monday, March 13, 2017
Tuesday, March 14, 2017
www.cityofhillsdale.org

In Person petitioners appeared by appointment as follows:

- M17-040 – 6:00 p.m. Mark Parker – assessed value – petitioner submitted an appraisal prepared for Hillsdale County National Bank on December 4, 2015 indicating a market value of \$62,000 for the property under appeal and a Comparable Market Analysis prepared March 13, 2017 indicating a value of \$46,500. Assessor Thomas provided a list and analysis to the Board of 9 comparable home sales within the same ECF neighborhood printed out of the BS&A CAMA software utilized by the City for property tax assessment. Mr. Parker had an appointment scheduled to appeal a second property but indicated that he had changed his mind about filing that appeal. Motion by McKay, seconded by Curtis to change the AV & TV to 31,500 based on the 2015 appraisal adjusted by the 1.009 inflation rate multiplier. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-041, M17-042, M17-043 and M17-044 – 6:30 p.m. Harold and Carla Stewart on behalf of themselves and Fred Stewart, Trustee of the Harold F and Helen M Stewart Joint Irrevocable Trust – assessed value – Petitioners corrected several items on the assessment of the house including no crawl space, poured concrete construction (not cement block), and no public sewer. Petitioners also felt there was a negative impact from the same blighted properties on Wolcott Street cited by prior petitioners. The balance of petitioner's testimony related to the amount of usable land for the improved parcel and the three vacant parcels. They indicated (and assessor confirmed using GIS) that each parcel dropped off in the back into a swamp and was further limited by an electrical transmission line easement. Assessor Thomas estimated the usable acreage for each parcel at about 3 acres.
 - M17-041 Motion by McKay, seconded by Curtis to change the AV to 100,000 with no effect on TV based on corrections to the building assessment, reduction in land value for portion under water and encroached, and a 5% negative economic obsolescence adjustment for blighted properties in the neighborhood. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-042 Motion by Curtis, seconded by Vear to change the AV to 15,000 with no effect on TV. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-043 Motion by Vear, seconded by McKay to change AV to 15,000 with no effect on TV. Motion carried unanimously.
 - M17-044 Motion by McKay, seconded by Vear to change AV to 15,000 with no effect on TV. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-045 – 7:00 p.m. Steve Wood – assessed value – Petitioner indicated that the assessment had increased in excess of the current value. Assessor Thomas confirmed that there was a significant reduction made to the depreciation applied against the structure for the current year but did not have an explanation for why the change was made. The most recent building permit was for a re-roof in 2007 and petitioner indicated that was the last improvement made. Petitioner further indicated that he had placed the property on the market in 2016 but had received no offers. Assessor Thomas printed off the listing information from www.realtor.com which showed an initial list price of \$72,000, reduced to \$69,000 in October, and to \$67,000 in January. Petitioner indicated that he had recently changed realtors. Assessor Thomas provided a list and analysis to the Board of 9 comparable home sales within the same ECF neighborhood printed out of the BS&A

2nd Floor Conference Room
Hillsdale City Hall
97 N Broad Street
Hillsdale, MI 49242

Board of Review Minutes
City of Hillsdale
March Meeting – MCL 211.30

Tuesday, March 7, 2017
Monday, March 13, 2017
Tuesday, March 14, 2017
www.cityofhillsdale.org

CAMA software utilized by the City for property tax assessment. Motion by McKay, seconded by Vear to change AV to 30,700 with no effect on TV. Motion carried unanimously.

Written petitions were presented by Assessor Thomas as follows:

- M17-003 Ryan – Assessed Value appeal (letter attached). City assessing staff member Kelly LoPresto was asked to contact Dr. Ryan to determine his contention of True Cash Value as it was not included with the information provided. Her phone call was returned by Dr. Ryan on Tuesday and the petition amended accordingly. Motion by McKay, seconded by Vear to change the AV to \$28,700 based on a 25% reduction for functional obsolescence. Motion carried unanimously.
- M17-046 – email and completed petition form signed by Lillian and Dominic Cusumano for CFP Group, LLC - assessed and taxable value – Petitioner is appealing the assessed value based on sales as of December 31, 2016 and the taxable value increase above the 1.009 inflation rate multiplier. The “Owner’s Estimate of True Cash Value” is \$8,303, which would have been the prior year’s taxable value increased for inflation. Assessor Thomas provided the Board with a residential land value study and map of the subject property geographic area showing sales of vacant land. The residential land value study analyzed sales of residential land outside of the Neighborhood Enterprise Zones between October 1, 2014 and September 30, 2016 and supported a land value of \$1.00 per square foot. That was the rate used in setting the 2017 assessments on residential lots. Assessor Thomas also provided documentation showing that the property in question had been assessed as 1.49 acres in prior years. In analyzing the sales data from petitioner’s purchase in January, the assessor discovered that the property is actually 2.58 acres. Pursuant to MCL 211.27a and MCL 211.34d, the “additions” used in calculating taxable value includes the addition of “omitted real property” and had been adjusted based on the prior year ratio of taxable to assessed value. Motion by McKay, seconded by Curtis deny petitioner’s request. Motion carried unanimously.

In Person petitioners appeared by appointment as follows:

- M17-047 – 8:00 p.m. Brad Michael – assessed value – Petitioner presented documentation comparing the assessment and property taxes for his property to those of neighboring properties. Based on the comparison, Mr. Michael determined that his property should be assessed at about \$3,500 per acre. He also provided pictures of the same blighted properties cited by the other petitioners from Wolcott Street. Assessor Thomas provided the Board with a copy of the 2017 vacant land study used by the Hillsdale County Equalization Department in appraising agricultural property between 10 and 19.99 acres in Fayette, Hillsdale, Scipio, Litchfield and Allen Townships. That study indicated values of \$4,380 for tillable land and \$3,190 for non-tillable. She indicated that it would be reasonable to assume that, based on the location of this property and the limited availability of city sewer for the area, Mr. Michael’s property would be in competition with acreage located outside the city if he were to list it for sale. Motion by Curtis, seconded by McKay to change the AV & TV to \$32,000 based on county land value study. Motion carried unanimously.

2nd Floor Conference Room
Hillsdale City Hall
97 N Broad Street
Hillsdale, MI 49242

Board of Review Minutes
City of Hillsdale
March Meeting – MCL 211.30

Tuesday, March 7, 2017
Monday, March 13, 2017
Tuesday, March 14, 2017
www.cityofhillsdale.org

Petition forms are to be attached and made a part of the official minutes. Official minutes shall be placed on file with the City Assessor and shall be made available upon request in compliance with the Freedom of Information Act pursuant to City of Hillsdale policies and procedures.

Assessor Thomas indicated that she would print off the required summary and other reports to be signed by the members of the Board upon verification that all decisions had been correctly entered into the CAMA software and would contact the Board members when they were ready.

General Public Comments – None

Final Adjournment – 9:29 p.m. Tuesday, March 14, 2017.

Next scheduled meeting: 9:00 a.m. Tuesday, July 18, 2017

Respectfully submitted,

 3/20/17

Richard Curtis, Board of Review Secretary

Typed from Mr. Curtis' notes by Kimberly Thomas, Assessor